Compensation Committee Meeting
November 13, 2018
SUNY Global Center
New York, NY
Committee Members

- Thomas P. DiNapoli
- H. Carl McCall
- Scott M. Stringer
- William C. Thompson, Jr.
H. CARL MCCALL
PRESENTATION ON THE MISSION AND LEGISLATIVE CHARGE
To examine, evaluate and make recommendations with respect to adequate levels of compensation, non-salary benefits, and allowances pursuant to section 5-a of the legislative law, for members of the legislature, statewide elected officials, and those state officers referred to in section 169 of the executive law.
Legislation that established the Committee

S. 7509-C 157 A. 9509-C
1. For purposes of paragraph b of this subdivision, the term "legislativ
2. e passage of the budget" shall have the same meaning as defined in
3. subdivision 3 of section 5 of the legislative law.
4. § 3. The committee shall only meet within the state and must hold
5. at least one hearing at which the public will be afforded an opportunity
6. to provide comments. The committee may hold additional public hearings
7. as it deems necessary. Such additional hearings, if any, may allow for a
8. public comment period.
9. 2. The members of the committee shall receive no compensation for
10. their services but shall be allowed their actual and necessary expenses
11. incurred in the performance of their duties hereunder. Nothing
12. contained herein shall prohibit a member of the committee from receiving
13. his or her salary earned by reason of their state employee position. The
14. members of the committee shall perform the duties herein personally, no
15. delegation of authority or attendance is allowed.
16. 3. No member of the committee shall be disqualified from holding any
17. other public office or employment, nor shall he or she forfeit any such
18. office or employment by reason of his or her appointment pursuant to
19. this section, notwithstanding the provisions of any general, special or
20. local law, regulation, ordinance or city charter.
21. 4. To the maximum extent feasible, the committee shall be entitled to
22. request and receive and shall utilize and be provided with such facili-
23. ties, resources and data of any court, department, division, board,
24. bureau, committee, agency or public authority of the state or any poli-
25. tical subdivision thereof as it may reasonably request to properly carry
26. out its powers and duties pursuant to this act.
27. 5. The committee may request, and shall receive, reasonable assistance
28. from state agency personnel as is necessary for the performance of its
29. function.

S. 7509-C 158 A. 9509-C
3. The committee shall make a report to the governor and the
4. legislature of its findings, conclusions, determinations and recommenda-
5. tions, if any, and should submit such report by December 10, 2018. Any
6. findings, conclusions, determinations and recommendations in the report
7. must be adopted by a majority vote of the committee. Each member of the
8. committee shall report their vote and describe their reasoning for their
9. determination.
10. § 7. This act shall take effect immediately and shall expire and be
11. deemed repealed December 31, 2018; provided, however, any recommenda-
12. tions of the committee that have been determined prior to such date
13. including 3 annual cost of living or salary adjustments, shall continue
14. to be in effect until amended or repealed by a subsequent recommendation
15. of the commission on legislative, judicial and executive compensation or
16. by passage of a new statute.
1. The overall economic climate
2. Rates of inflation
3. Changes in public-sector spending
4. The levels of compensation and non-salary benefits received by executive branch officials and legislators of other states and of the federal government
5. The levels of compensation and non-salary benefits received by comparable professionals in government, academia and private and nonprofit enterprise
6. The ability to attract talent in competition with comparable private sector positions
7. And the state's ability to fund increases in compensation and non-salary benefits.
THOMAS DINAPOLI
PRESENTATION ON THE
COMPENSATION COMMITTEE WEBSITE
An interactive website has been created using a government URL. This website will be the main means of communicating with and receiving information from the public. The web address is https://nyscompensation.ny.gov/.

The website includes:
- Mission of the Compensation Committee
- Legislation that established the Compensation Committee
- Comparisons of NYS compensation of legislators and other officials to other states and NYC
- Schedule of meetings and public hearings for the Compensation Committee
- Instructions for contacting the Compensation Committee
Presentation to New York State Compensation Committee

Nov. 13, 2018
Background

• Compensation Committee enacted in part HHH of General Government Article 7 bill, SFY 2019 Budget.

• Mission
  • Examine, evaluate and make recommendations with respect to adequate levels of compensation, non-salary benefits, and allowances pursuant to section 5-a of the legislative law, for members of the legislature, statewide elected officials, and those state officers referred to in section 169 of the executive law.

• Criteria
  • All appropriate factors including, but not limited to: the parties' performance and timely fulfillment of their statutory and Constitutional responsibilities; the overall economic climate; rates of inflation; changes in public-sector spending; the levels of compensation and non-salary benefits received by executive branch officials and legislators of other states and of the federal government; the levels of compensation and non-salary benefits received by comparable professionals in government, academia and private and nonprofit enterprise; the ability to attract talent in competition with comparable private sector positions; and the state's ability to fund increases in compensation and non-salary benefits.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legislative Criterion</th>
<th>Measures used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rates of inflation</td>
<td>Change in CPI-U for NYC Metro and U.S. Northeast, 1998-2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in public-sector spending</td>
<td>Change in State General Fund expenditures, SFY 97-98 to SFY 16-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of compensation: other states and federal government</td>
<td>Highest-compensated other states; New York City; federal government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of compensation: comparable professionals in government, academia, private and non-profit enterprises</td>
<td>Change in comparable private sector compensation, 1998-2017, by industry sector and occupational category</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to attract talent in competition with comparable private sector positions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## State Comparisons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Gross State Product ($ millions)</th>
<th>Operating Budget ($ millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>39,536,653</td>
<td>$2,746.9</td>
<td>$167.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>28,304,596</td>
<td>$1,696.2</td>
<td>$77.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>20,984,400</td>
<td>$967.3</td>
<td>$53.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>New York</strong></td>
<td><strong>19,849,399</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,547.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>$99.6</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>12,805,537</td>
<td>$752.1</td>
<td>$50.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>12,802,023</td>
<td>$820.4</td>
<td>$49.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>9,005,644</td>
<td>$591.7</td>
<td>$42.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>8,622,698</td>
<td>$795.1</td>
<td>$60.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>6,859,819</td>
<td>$527.5</td>
<td>$47.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>3,588,184</td>
<td>$260.8</td>
<td>$21.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• **Base pay**: $79,500
• **Last pay increase**: 1998

**Other compensation**
  • **Allowances**: $9,000 (ranking minority committee member) to $41,500 (Speaker and Senate President)
  • **Per Diem**: $174/day (overnight); $59/day (non-overnight)
  • **Mileage rate**: 54.5¢/mile

**Outside income**
  • Income from outside employment over $5,000 requires advisory opinion from Legislative Ethics Commission
  • Less than one-third of members with financial disclosure submission in 2016 had income from business or employment
Legislature: Comparisons

- Legislative Base Salary: $79,500
- Pennsylvania: $87,180
- California: $107,240
- NYC Council: $148,500
- CPI-U: US Northeast: $121,372
- Gen'l Fund Expenditures: $145,260
- Occupation: Lawyers: $159,871
- All Private Industry: $140,160
- Sector: Legal Services: $165,742
Statewide Elected Officials: Background

- Governor: $179,000
  - Set by joint resolution; effective 1/1/99

- Lieutenant Governor, Comptroller, and Attorney General: $151,500
  - Set in Executive Law; effective 1/1/99
Governor: Comparisons

- New York State (NYS) - $179,000
- Pennsylvania - $194,850
- California - $195,806
- NYC Mayor - $258,750
- CPI-U: US Northeast - $273,278
- Gen'l Fund Expenditures - $327,063
- All Private Industry - $315,580
- Sector: Company Management - $293,396
- Occupation: Chief Executive - $370,051

Cost of living / spending growth
Private sector wage growth
Lieutenant Governor: Comparisons

- New York State: $151,500
- Colorado: $153,768
- Pennsylvania: $163,672
- NYC: Public Advocate: $184,800
- CPI-U: US Northeast: $231,294
- General Fund Expenditures: $276,816
- All Private Industry: $267,097
- Sector: Company Management: $248,321
- Occupation: Chief Executive: $313,199
Attorney General: Comparisons

- New York State: $151,500
- Wyoming: $175,000
- Tennessee: $185,064
- NYC: Corp Counsel: $226,366
- CPI-U: US Northeast: $231,294
- Gen'l Fund Expenditures: $276,816
- All Private Industry: $267,097
- Sector: Company Management: $248,321
- Occupation: Chief Executive: $313,199

Cost of living / spending growth
Private sector wage growth

NYS
Other Jurisdictions

New York City Comptroller Scott M. Stringer
Comptroller: Comparisons

- New York State: $151,500
- Other Jurisdictions: $179,525
- Tennessee: $201,852
- NYC: $209,050
- CPI-U: US Northeast: $231,294
- General Fund Expenditures: $276,816
- All Private Industry: $267,097
- Sector: Company Management: $248,321
- Occupation: Chief Executive: $313,199

Categories:
- NYS
- Other Jurisdictions
- Cost of living / spending growth
- Private sector wage growth
Sec. 169 Executive Appointees

- Commissioner salaries set by sec. 169 of the Executive Law
- Effective 1/1/99
- Six levels, from $90,800 to $136,000
Executive Appointees: Comparisons (Growth)

- **Comissioner (A)**: $136,000
- **CPI-U: US Northeast**: $231,294
- **Gen'l Fund Expenditures**: $276,816
- **All Private Industry**: $267,097
- **Sector: Company Management**: $248,321
- **Occupation: Chief Executive**: $313,199
## Executive Appointees: Comparisons (Other Jurisdictions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Highest</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Lowest</th>
<th>New York City</th>
<th>New York State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corrections</td>
<td>$266,500</td>
<td>$155,879</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
<td>$216,300</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>$276,000</td>
<td>$161,522</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
<td>$222,182</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>$256,085</td>
<td>$155,879</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
<td>$226,366</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>$299,812</td>
<td>$155,879</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
<td>$214,413</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Env. Conservation</td>
<td>$210,695</td>
<td>$139,050</td>
<td>$104,235</td>
<td>$219,773</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Police</td>
<td>$258,286</td>
<td>$167,661</td>
<td>$132,300</td>
<td>$226,366</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Services</td>
<td>$183,759</td>
<td>$146,743</td>
<td>$108,671</td>
<td>$226,366</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Services</td>
<td>$242,925</td>
<td>$137,686</td>
<td>$101,463</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$127,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks &amp; Recreation</td>
<td>$195,749</td>
<td>$130,000</td>
<td>$99,039</td>
<td>$226,366</td>
<td>$127,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture &amp; Markets</td>
<td>$201,869</td>
<td>$136,000</td>
<td>$119,540</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$120,800</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comparison States: CA, CT, DE, FL, IL, MD, MA, NJ, PA, TX
# Measures Used in Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Percent Change, 1998-2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CPI-U Northeast</td>
<td>52.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPI-U NY-NJ-PA</td>
<td>54.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State General Fund Expenditures <em>(SFY 97-98 – SFY 16-17)</em></td>
<td>82.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Percent Change, 1998-2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Managers and Top Executives</td>
<td>106.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLS Occupation Code 11-1011/1021</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyers</td>
<td>101.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLS Occupation Code 123-1011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector: All Private Industry</td>
<td>76.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector: Legal Services</td>
<td>108.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAICS 5411</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Sec. 169 Commissioner Salaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A ($136,000)</th>
<th>B ($127,000)</th>
<th>C ($120,800)</th>
<th>D ($109,800)</th>
<th>E ($101,600)</th>
<th>F ($90,800)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department of corrections and community Supervision</td>
<td>Department of Labor</td>
<td>Department of Agriculture and Markets</td>
<td>Office for the Aging</td>
<td>State Athletic Commission</td>
<td>Adirondack Park Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Department</td>
<td>Public Services Commission (Chair)</td>
<td>Office of Alcoholism and Substance Abuse Services</td>
<td>Division of Human Rights</td>
<td>Office of Victim Services</td>
<td>State Commission of Corrections (Members)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Health</td>
<td>Department of Taxation and Finance</td>
<td>Adjuvant General</td>
<td>Department of Public Services (Commissioner)</td>
<td>Human Rights Appeal Board</td>
<td>Unemployment Insurance Appeal Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of Mental Health</td>
<td>Division of Financial Services</td>
<td>State Civil Service Commission</td>
<td>Justice Center</td>
<td>Industrial Board of Appeals</td>
<td>Worker’s Compensation Board (Members)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office for People with Developmental Disabilities</td>
<td>Division of Criminal Justice Services</td>
<td>Department of Economic Development</td>
<td>Council on the Arts</td>
<td>State Commission of Corrections (Chair)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of Children and Family</td>
<td>Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historical Preservation</td>
<td>NYS Energy Research and Development Authority</td>
<td>Board of Social Welfare</td>
<td>Board of Parole (Members)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance</td>
<td>Higher Education Services Corporation</td>
<td>Commission on Alcoholism and Substance Abuse Prevention and Education</td>
<td>Unemployment Insurance Appeal Board</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State University of New York</td>
<td>Department of Motor Vehicles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Division of Veterans’ Affairs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Transportation</td>
<td>Board of Parole (Member-Chair)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Workers’ Compensation Board (Vice Chair)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Environmental Conservation</td>
<td>Secretary of State</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division of State Police</td>
<td>Public Employment Relations Board (Chair)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of General Services</td>
<td>Housing Finance Agency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaming Commission</td>
<td>Housing and Community Renewal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Services</td>
<td>State Insurance Fund</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>State Liquor Authority (Commissioner-Chair)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Workers’ Compensation Board (Chair)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WILLIAM THOMPSON, JR.
PRESENTATION REGARDING THE PUBLIC HEARINGS
NOTICE OF THE NEW YORK STATE COMPENSATION COMMITTEE  
PUBLIC HEARING

November 7, 2018

ANNOUNCEMENT OF PUBLIC HEARING

TO:
All Concerned Individuals

FROM:
The New York State Compensation Committee

DATE, PLACE AND TIME:
Wednesday, November 28, 2018 
State University Plaza
363 Broadway
Center Tower – Boardroom
Albany, NY 12240
Time: 11:30 AM

Friday, November 30, 2018
State University of New York
Global Center
116 East 55th Street
Global Classroom
New York, NY 10022
Time: 12:00 PM

PURPOSE:
The purpose of the Compensation Committee Public Hearing is to receive testimony and statements from concerned individuals about compensation issues.

IN ORDER TO REGISTER TO SPEAK AT THE HEARING:

1. Persons wishing to present prepared testimony to the New York State Compensation Committee are requested to send a brief description of the subject of their proposed testimony, by no later than noon on Friday, November 23, 2018, to the Compensation Committee at compensation_committee2018@nysmail.com. Please specify when you will be able to provide your testimony, whether November 28th at SUNY Plaza in Albany, NY or November 30th at SUNY Global Center in New York City. Please address your letter to the NYS Compensation Committee Members, and provide us with a telephone number and address at which you can be reached so that we can confirm that you have a reserved place on the agenda. Testimony will be limited to five minutes, and speakers are requested to provide five copies of their written testimony to the Hearing Registration Officer, 116 East 55th Street, New York, NY 10022 prior to the day of the Hearing.

2. Persons who wish to make brief extemporaneous comments (no more than three minutes) are requested to provide their names to the Hearing Registration Officer on the day of the Hearing, in advance of the beginning of the Hearing. Time for such comments will be set aside at the end of the Hearing, and such persons will be called upon in the order in which they register with the Hearing Registration Officer.
QUESTIONS?
The Committee is Meeting in Executive Session.
Compensation Committee Meeting
November 13, 2018
SUNY Global Center
New York, NY